

Doc No: SC22/WG21/N3315
PL22.16/11-0085
Date: 2011-09-02
Project: JTC1.22.32
Reply to: Kyle Kloeppe
Riverbed Technology
Kyle.Kloeppe@riverbed.com

Minutes

PL22.16 Meeting No. 57
WG21 Meeting No. 52
15-19 August 2011 Bloomington, Indiana, USA

Chair: Stephen D. Clamage
Secretary: Kyle Kloeppe

1. Opening activities

Clamage calls the meeting to order at 9:07 (UTC-5) Monday 15 August 2011.

1.1 Opening comments, welcome from host

Andrew Lumsdaine welcomes the attendees and provides organizational information.

1.2 Introductions

Clamage has attendees introduce themselves.

1.3 Meeting guidelines (Anti-Trust)

Clamage directs group to the following websites without further comment:

- http://www.incits.org/pat_slides.pdf
- <http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm>

1.4 Membership, voting rights, and procedures for the meeting

Clamage reviews the rules for membership and voting rights. Nelson reviews guidelines for filling in the attendance sheet.

1.5 Agenda review and approval

Clamage presents the agenda (document PL22.16/10-0035 = WG21/N3265).

Motion to approve the agenda:

Moved by: Clamage

Seconded by: Brown

PL22.16		WG21	
In favor:	23	In favor:	7
Opposed:	0	Opposed:	0
Abstain:	0	Abstain:	0

1.6 WG progress reports and work plans for the week

Progress Reports

Each Working Group chair presents group progress and plans for the coming week.

1.7 Approval of the minutes of the previous meeting

Nelson asks what the status of the ISO ballot was. Clamage states that it passed: ISO approved, ANSI accepted.

Motion to approve the minutes (N3274/N3275)

Moved by: Brown

Seconded by: Hedquist

PL22.16		WG21	
In favor:	23	In favor:	7
Opposed:	0	Opposed:	0
Abstain:	0	Abstain:	0

1.8 Liaison reports

WG14 Report

Plum reports that the DIS for C is still in ballot and there have been no changes since last WG21 meeting.

WG23 Report

Plum announced that WG23 will approach WG21 to work on a vulnerabilities annex for C++. Plum gives an overview of WG23:

WG23 meets 3-4 times per year with the goal of putting together a number of language specific safety and security issues list. Each language will put in a separate annex. Python is already done. Ada has two: ISO Ada and Spark Ada. WG23 is looking for someone to work on Java Script as it has many real vulnerabilities.

1.9 Editor's report

Becker reports INCITES has three weeks to publication after responses. Brown asks if there is a backup editor. Crowl responds that he was the backup editor. Brown asks if he would like to continue. Crowl expresses indifference. Plum advocated that he continue as the backup editor. Plum states the purpose of the backup editor is to ensure the production of the standard document is not dependent any one person or proprietary technology.

1.10 New business requiring actions by the committee

Plum states dates for next meeting in Kona is 6-10 February 2012.

Nelson asks if we are going to talk about language direction. Clamage notes that logical people for that discussion are not yet present. Vollmann would like to discuss language direction as was planned during teleconference. He asks if we can meet later since Sutter has not yet arrived. Clamage says we are meeting either later this afternoon or tomorrow.

2. Organize subgroups, establish working procedures.

Clamage announces that those present will break up into working groups until Thursday afternoon. He notes that the committee was in recess until then.

3. WG sessions (Core and Library).

The group breaks up to meet in separate working group sessions.

Tuesday 16 August 8:30 a.m. - 5:30 p.m.

4. WG sessions continue.

Wednesday 17 August 8:30 a.m. - 5:30 p.m.

5. WG sessions continue.

Thursday 18 August 8:30 a.m. - 12:00 p.m.

6. WG sessions continue.

Thursday 18 August 1:30 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.

7. General session.

7.1 WG status and progress reports.

Clamage calls general session to order. He announces a change from published agenda. There will be a general session tomorrow morning to discuss future directions for the language. After that closing ceremonies will be held at 11 a.m. Clamage asks if there are any objections. There are none. Clamage asks for working group status reports.

Core Working Group

Miller presents CWG status.

Library Working Group

Meredith reports LWG status.

Concurrency Working Group

Crowl reports concurrency status.

7.2 Presentation and discussion of proposed responses to public comments. Straw votes taken.

Clamage announces there will be only one motion for tomorrow: the delegation for 2012. Clamage asks if there is any further business for today. Halpern asks what the schedule is for tomorrow. Clamage states that we will meet tomorrow morning at 8:30 a.m. and discuss future directions for the language. That discussion will be cut off at 11 a.m. to allow the meeting to close before lunch.

The group breaks up to meet in separate working group sessions.

Thursday 18 August 2:30 p.m. – 5:30 p.m.

8. WG sessions continue.

Friday 19 August 8:30 a.m. – 10:00 a.m.

9. ~~WG sessions continue~~ Plenary session to discuss future direction of language

Clamage calls meeting to order. Sutter leads discussion of future directions of language.

10. Review of the meeting

10.1 Motions

PL22.16 Motions

Motion 1

Move the following voting members of PL22.16 be designated as the US delegation to JTC1 SC22/WG21 for any and all WG21 meetings for 2012:

- Barry Hedquist, Perennial;
- Steve Clamage, Oracle;
- William 'Mike' Miller, Edison Design Group;
- Howard Hinnant, Apple Computer;
- Walter Brown, Fermi National Accelerator Laboratory;
- Lawrence Crowl, Google;
- Thomas Plum, Plum Hall;

- Bjarne Stroustrup, Texas A&M University;
- Clark Nelson, Intel.

Moved by: Hedquist

Seconded by: Nelson

PL22.16	
In favor:	22
Opposed:	0
Abstain:	0

Additional Motions

Du Toit moves to thank the host. Applause ensues.

10.2 Review of action items, decisions made, and documents adopted by the committee

Meredith asks for review of a call for papers LWG came up with yesterday. Clamage puts it on the screen and asks if the room is in agreement. Clamage asks the secretary if the proposal will make it into the minutes. Kloepper says it will. Here is the statement:

The C++ committee Library Working Group welcomes proposals for library extensions which will be considered starting in the February 2012 meeting. We have not yet set out an overall timeline for future library extensions, but are ready to consider new proposals at this point.

To increase the chances of your proposal being accepted by the committee, we strongly recommend that a committee member willing to champion your proposal (this could be you yourself or a delegate) attend upcoming meeting to help shepherd your proposal through the process.

10.3 Issues delayed until today.

Clamage reported that there were no issues delayed until today.

11. Plans for the future

11.1 Next and following meetings

Sutter presents the meeting schedule for upcoming meetings:

- 6-10 February 2012: Kona, Hawaii, USA – Sponsored by Plum Hall and Bloomberg
- September 2012 (estimated): Portland, Oregon, USA – Sponsored by Intel
- Spring 2013 – TBD
- Fall 2013 – Chicago, Illinois, USA – Sponsored by DRW Trading Group
- Spring 2014 – TBD
- Fall 2014 – Urbana-Champaign, Illinois, USA – Sponsored by University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Meredith asks if these will be five day meetings. Sutter says yes they will be five day meetings.

Discussions on future meetings and plans ensue.

11.2 Mailings

Nelson reviewed the following mailing deadlines:

- Post-Bloomington: 2 September 2011
- Pre-Kona: 13 January 2012

12. Adjournment

Clamage will entertain motion to adjourn.

Nelson moves to adjourn. Brown seconds.

The meeting adjourns at 09:57 (UTC-5) Friday 19 August 2011.

Attendance

Company/Organization	NB	Representative	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
Apple		Howard E. Hinnant	V	V	V	V	V	
Apple		Doug Gregor	A	A	A	A	A	
Bloomberg		John Lakos	V	V	V	V	V	
Bloomberg		Alisdair Meredith	A	A	A	A	A	
Bloomberg		Dietmar Kühl	A	A	A	A	A	
BoostPro Computing		David Abrahams	V	V	V	V	V	
BoostPro Computing		John Wiegley	A	A	A	A	A	
Carnegie Mellon University		David Svoboda	V	V	V	V	V	
Dinkumware		P. J. Plauger	V	V	V	V	V	
Dinkumware		Tana Plauger	A	A	A	A	A	
Edison Design Group		Jens Maurer	A	A	A	A	A	
Edison Design Group		William M. Miller	A	A	A	A	A	
Edison Design Group		Daveed Vandevoorde	V	V	V	V	V	
Fermi Nat. Accelerator Lab		Walter E. Brown	V	V	V	V	V	
Fujitsu Laboratories of America		Maarten Wiggers	V	V	V	V	V	
Gimpel Software		James Widman	V	V	V	V	V	
Google		Lawrence Crowl	V	V	V	V	V	
Google		James Dennett	A	A	A	A	A	
IBM	CA	Michael Wong	V	V	V	V	V	
Indiana University		Andrew Lumsdaine	V	V	V			
Indiana University		Jeremiah Willcock	A	A	A	V	V	
Indiana University		Larisse Voufo	A	A	A	A	A	
Indiana University		Marcin Zalewski	A	A	A	A	A	
Intel		Clark Nelson	V	V	V	V	V	
Intel		Pablo Halpern	A	A	A	A	A	
Intel	CA	Stefanus Du Toit	A	A	A	A	A	
Microsoft		Herb Sutter	V			V	V	

Company/Organization	NB	Representative	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
NVidia		Olivier Giroux	A	A	A			
Oracle		Stephen D. Clamage	V	V	V	V	V	
Perennial	US	Barry Hedquist	V	V	V	V	V	
Plum Hall		Thomas Plum	V	V				
Programming Research Group		Christof Meerwald	V	V	V	V	V	
Red Hat		Jason Merrill	V	V	V	V	V	
Red Hat		Benjamin Kosnik	A	A	A	A	A	
Riverbed Technology		Kyle Kloepper	V	V	V	V	V	
Riverbed Technology		Neal Meyer	A	A	A	A	A	
Roundhouse Consulting		Pete Becker	V	V	V	V	V	
Seymour		Bill Seymour	V	V	V	V	V	
Symantec		Mike Spertus	V	V	V	V	V	
PL22.16 Non-members								
HSR	CH	Peter Sommerlad	N	N	N	N	N	
LTK Engineering		Alan Talbot	N	N	N	N	N	
University Carlos III	ES	J. Daniel Garcia	N	N	N	N	N	
Vollmann Engineering	CH	Detlef Vollmann	N	N	N	N	N	
	FI	Ville Voutilainen	N	N	N	N	N	
	UK	Roger Orr	N	N	N	N	N	
Full Life Financial LLC		Keith Newcomb	N					
Eagle Glimpse		Daniel Heath	N	N	N	N	N	
BLDL, UNIV. OF BERGEN	NO	Magne Haveraaen	N	N	N	N	N	